

Citation style

Byl, Vitali: Rezension über: Louise Nyholm Kallestrup / Raisa Maria Toivo (eds.), *Contesting Orthodoxy in Medieval and Early Modern Europe. Heresy, Magic and Witchcraft*, Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2017, in: *Zeitschrift für Historische Forschung* (ZHF), 45 (2018), 3, S. 501-503, DOI: 10.15463/rec.799967305



copyright

This article may be downloaded and/or used within the private copying exemption. Any further use without permission of the rights owner shall be subject to legal licences (§§ 44a-63a UrhG / German Copyright Act).

inwieweit das jeweilige Thema durch die Arbeiten von Gerard Rouwhorst oder durch persönliche Begegnungen mit ihm seine Prägung erfahren hat.

Im Ergebnis handelt es sich also eher um eine bunte Mischung vorwiegend sehr anspruchsvoller wissenschaftlicher Beiträge aus der Liturgiewissenschaft und der Judaistik, die damit aber das breite Interesse des Gefeierten widerspiegelt und somit als Festschrift sehr gelungen ist.

Martin Lüsttraeten, Mainz

Kallestrup, Louise Nyholm / Raisa M. Toivo (Hrsg.), *Contesting Orthodoxy in Medieval and Early Modern Europe. Heresy, Magic and Witchcraft* (Palgrave Historical Studies in Witchcraft and Magic), Cham 2017, Palgrave Macmillan, XVII u. 349 S. / Abb., £ 63,00.

“Maybe you who condemn me are in greater fear than I who am condemned”. These words of the most famous heretic Giordano Bruno might be a proper epigraph to the collection of essays that aims to explore the variety of real and imagined challenges to religious orthodoxy and the ways the orthodoxy struck back in late medieval and early modern Europe. The volume originates from a conference, “Heresy, Magic and Natural Philosophy”, which took place on 8–10 November 2010, hosted by the Centre for Medieval Studies at the University of Southern Denmark, Odense. In the seven years following the conference, a selection of the papers was rewritten to form a collection of essays.

In its three parts, the 350-page edited volume discusses the challenges orthodoxy faced: heresy, magic, and witchcraft. The book approaches these subjects with a certain originality. First, it uses the perspective of orthodoxy to offer a new generalizing perspective on these issues. Second, the study examines cases from peripheries and borderlands – both in their geographic and thematic meanings.

The introduction, written by the editors, conceptualizes general ideas and summarizes the definitions and approaches taken by the various authors. It defines religious orthodoxy as “strict adherence to established dogma, usually one that was presented as original and pure” (2). However, the majority of scholars discuss orthodoxy and other approaches from their perspectives through specific cases and particular regions. The editors strive to break down common scholarly barriers of periodization, disciplines, and geography to look beyond the limitations (11). Particularly, they challenge the traditional distinction between Late Middle Ages and Early Modernity. Furthermore, the authors of the articles often broaden their scope and trace their argument to biblical or pagan, Early Christian or High Medieval times. With this chronological approach, the collection accomplishes its goal: to examine continuities as well as changes in concepts and understandings of periodization, the role of orthodoxy, and regional perspectives.

Furthermore, the editors highlight that “the geographical pattern of similarities and diversities suggests the comparative approach, transcending confessional as well as national borders” (12). Indeed, despite the narrow scope of particular case studies, the collection as a whole provides a vivid opportunity for cross-border comparison. As for geography, Scandinavia receives the most attention: five out of thirteen essays are devoted to this region, which until recently has only played a marginal role in such studies. One of the essays, by Rune Blix Hagen, goes even further – to the periphery of the periphery – to the Sami-inhabited arctic Norway, during the time of Danish expansion. Following more traditional scholarship, the regions of northern Italy, the Netherlands, German-French and German-Slavic borderlands, as well as a general European per-

spective, are also covered. Although the spatial coverage of the collection is not comprehensive, it is nevertheless broad and diverse.

The first part of the volume, which is also the shortest, discusses heresy which is defined as the intentional break with church dogma (9). However, the essays collected in this part tend to broaden the understanding of heresy by offering interesting insights into the nature of heresy in other geographic settings such as Scandinavia (Stephen Mitchell). Medieval ghost stories, in spite of their tension with Christian teachings about the dead, were used to impart the same message to their readers (Nancy Mandeville Caciola). On the contrary, another essay notes that a Bolognese charlatan, doing his best to dissociate himself from dangerous issues, was seen with suspicion because of his vulnerable professional position between magic and science (David Gentilcore).

Part II of the collection looks at attempts to influence the world with magic that would not break orthodoxy but contest it nonetheless. Since Christianity itself often relied on the “miraculous”, it was a natural temptation to use its magic potential: by mixing Christian and pagan elements (Leif Søndergaard) or by summoning God’s powerful and mysterious host – angels (Richard Kieckhefer). However, orthodoxy could become heresy without pushing the boundaries: diligent adherence to Catholic practices in the Lutheran state turned into, at best, superstition or, at worst, – sorcery (Raisa Maria Toivo). At the same time, the recognition of the natural magic as neutral could help to reconcile the religious doctrine with new folk practices for emerging industrial needs (Johannes Dillinger).

The third section is the most extensive part of the volume and brings together essays on witchcraft. Since the late Middle Ages, witchcraft has incorporated both heresy and magical elements as the archenemy of Christian society. To illustrate the change in the understanding of witchcraft, Charles Zika traces the visual evolution of the biblical Witch of Endor. In various countries, religious intellectuals (both Catholic and Protestant) called for the growing secular state to prosecute this heretical as well as criminal offence, which was seen to threaten the creation of a godly society (Rita Voltmer, Matteo Duni, Louise Nyholm Kallestrup). Witch-hunt was not an isolated phenomenon, and two contributors in particular seek to situate it within a broader context. Louise Nyholm Kallestrup examines theory and practice of witch persecution within deep intellectual and political transformations, precipitated by the Reformation when a secular state took over the responsibility for moral and spiritual supervision. Rune Blix Hagen examines witch trials of Norwegian females and Sami males as a part of Danish state-building and modernization efforts. Besides these articles on the zealous fight against witchcraft, another piece engages with the Dutch literature that ridiculed both popular beliefs in cunning folk and repressive approaches by authorities (Willem de Blécourt).

The collection’s writing and tone deserves commendation. The majority of the texts is not overloaded with dull and tedious academic language but is easy and exciting to read. Since the book originates from works presented at a conference, some flaws common for these anthologies need to be mentioned. It lacks a deep and comprehensive study of the stipulated topic – and rather encompasses a set of selected cases, unevenly distributed in chronology, geography, and focal points. A critical reader will notice that not every text corresponds strictly to the topic of the book. More maps and illustrations could have made some articles clearer. Thus, the book makes a contribution to the synthetic comprehension of heresy, magic, and witchcraft and brings some important details to the bright mosaic of European intellectual past. The volume can be recommended, first of all, to researchers of religious and intellectual history, folklore, the history of magic

and witchcraft. Moreover, it can bring new perspectives for understanding the genesis of western science and early modern state-building as well as to the field of border studies.

Vitali Byl, Greifswald

Grüne, Niels / Jonas Hübner / Gerhard Siegl (Hrsg.), Ländliche Gemeingüter. Kollektive Ressourcennutzung in der europäischen Agrarwirtschaft / Rural Commons. Collective Use of Resources in the European Agrarian Economy (Jahrbuch für Geschichte des ländlichen Raums, 2015), Innsbruck / Wien / Bozen 2016, StudienVerlag, 310 S. / Abb., € 29,90.

Ländliche Gemeingüter, Allmenden oder Gemeinheiten bildeten ein wichtiges Element der vormodernen traditionellen Agrarwirtschaft. Ihre Funktionen, ihr wirtschaftlicher wie sozialer Stellenwert und ihre Auflösung sind für verschiedene europäische Regionen unterschiedlich intensiv erforscht worden. Der vorliegende Sammelband unternimmt den verdienstvollen Versuch, einen Überblick über den Forschungsstand in einer gesamteuropäischen Perspektive zu entwickeln. Dazu wurden europaweit Experten aufgerufen, an gemeinsamen Sektionen auf der Rural History Conference 2013 in Bern teilzunehmen und ihre Beiträge im Nachgang für den gemeinsamen Band auszuarbeiten. Das Ergebnis untermauert die Fruchtbarkeit einer länderübergreifenden Perspektive, wie sie auf internationalen Tagungen gezielt befördert wird.

Der Band umfasst 21 Beiträge, die drei Themenbereichen zugeordnet sind. Die Beiträge im ersten Teil diskutieren den Forschungsstand in sieben europäischen Ländern und Regionen. Im zweiten Teil werden aktuelle Forschungsarbeiten vorgestellt, die das alltägliche Funktionieren und die immer wieder aufflammenden Konflikte um Ansprüche und Nutzungsrechte anhand von lokalen und regionalen Fallstudien untersuchen. Auch im dritten Teil stehen laufende Forschungsarbeiten im Mittelpunkt, die Autoren bemühen sich jedoch um eine vergleichende Perspektive.

Die geographische Verortung der Beiträge spiegelt zum Teil die unterschiedlich intensive Erforschung von kollektiver Nutzung wider, ist doch der südeuropäische Raum kaum vertreten. Eine Ausnahme bilden zwei Beiträge, in denen zum einen das Verschwinden der ländlichen Gemeingüter in der nordspanischen Provinz León im frühen 19. Jahrhundert und dessen Folgen für die wirtschaftliche Situation der dörflichen Unterschichten diskutiert wird (José A. Serrano Álvarez). Der Artikel von José-Miguel Lana bietet zum anderen einen Forschungsüberblick für Spanien und verweist auf das wachsende Interesse für die konkrete alltägliche Nutzung der Kollektivgüter, das auch in anderen Ländern zu beobachten ist. Gleich drei Artikel diskutieren den (ernüchternden) Stand der Forschung für osteuropäische Länder bzw. Regionen, namentlich Polen, Böhmen und Ungarn. Piotr Guzowski, Eduard Maur und Antal Szántay verweisen auf die vielen offenen Fragen, die von der Forschung bisher kaum angegangen wurden, zeigen aber auch Wege auf, die auf eine ertragreiche zukünftige Erforschung hoffen lassen.

Von den sechs Fallstudien behandeln drei den alpinen Raum, von den ebenfalls sechs vergleichenden Untersuchungen beziehen gleich vier die Alpen und angrenzende Regionen ein. So wird augenfällig, wo neben dem nordwesteuropäischen Raum der aktuelle Schwerpunkt der Forschung liegt. Nordwesteuropa ist mit Bezug auf die Gemeingüter recht gut erforscht, jedoch gilt dies nicht für alle Länder. Eher ernüchternd fällt der Forschungsüberblick für Deutschland aus, den Stefan Brakensiek in seinem Beitrag zeichnet. An der lebendigen internationalen Diskussion um den Wert und die