

Zitierhinweis

Kojanić, Ognjen: Rezension über: Adam Fagan / Indraneel Sircar (eds.), *Activist Citizenship in Southeast Europe*, London: Routledge, 2018, in: *Comparative Southeast European Studies*, 67 (2019), 4, S. 559-562, <https://recensio-stag.lorax.syslab.com/r/4af58aecb463455ca0666aa79a8b5f75>



copyright

Dieser Beitrag kann vom Nutzer zu eigenen nicht-kommerziellen Zwecken heruntergeladen und/oder ausgedruckt werden. Darüber hinausgehende Nutzungen sind ohne weitere Genehmigung der Rechteinhaber nur im Rahmen der gesetzlichen Schrankenbestimmungen (§§ 44a-63a UrhG) zulässig.

both the mental/emotional and the physical spaces mentioned above, which have been created and/or appropriated by the activists themselves. The other task was to take stock 'of the achievements, tensions, contradictions, and emotionally laden processes of post-Yugoslav lesbian activists' (2); in other words, to build an archive of lesbian lives and lesbian activism in the region. Since activists are not (and cannot be) concerned with documenting the things they do, this collection tries to fill the gap, to create a memory that will help fight 'against erasure and disappearance' (10), by combining the historical account of the development of activism with activists' oral histories. Archives, however, do not only offer a glimpse of the past—which is in this collection viewed through nostalgic glasses at times—but are also seen as a way of healing the wounds inflicted by war.

On a meta-level, the mentioned three key notions of 'sisterhood', 'space' and 'knowledge' are to be found in every text of the collection. The 'sisterhood' is visible not only in several co-authored chapters, but in the mutual care and concern evident in the authors' reflections on their (processes of) writing, which they were asked to share with the editors. In addition to documenting how conditions for speaking up have been created, this collection also creates these conditions itself, precisely by offering a space to lesbian voices. And since it forms a part of the archives that document the past, it is in itself a form of (creating) 'knowledge'. The glue tying the meta-world of the volume together with the world 'out there' are the authors' ethnographical ego-statements about their personal involvement in activism.

To conclude, this volume is a valuable and much needed contribution to the re-

cent history (or *herstory*) of (feminist) lesbian organising in the successor states of Yugoslavia, showing the similarities and differences existing in this multinational, multilingual, and multiconfessional region. In addition, it amounts to a call to form ever tighter and firmer ties within the regional, transnational community of women (feminists, lesbians and trans women), a call to collaborate more closely and form networks in order to share knowledge and experiences. This is in line with the intention of the editors to 'align this volume with the tradition of lesbian theoretical and activist interventions' (10), in other words, to make it both scholarly and activist, a task that they have successfully accomplished.

Sandra Antulov (Rijeka)

Adam Fagan/Indraneel Sircar, eds,
Activist Citizenship in Southeast Europe, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge
2018. 166 pp. ISBN 978-1-138--60489-6,
£ 115.00

The volume *Activist Citizenship in Southeast Europe* gathers seven excellent case studies of practices that expand the notion of political action beyond the institutions of liberal democracy. The introduction, written by the editors Adam Fagan and Indraneel Sircar, discusses three important contributions that the volume makes. First, despite the fact that the countries of Southeastern Europe are commonly characterised as having 'weak' civil societies, various forms of activism do take place there. Second, by delving into the history of some of the case studies, the authors show that the forms of activism they study did not develop within the core and then disseminated to South-

both the mental/emotional and the physical spaces mentioned above, which have been created and/or appropriated by the activists themselves. The other task was to take stock 'of the achievements, tensions, contradictions, and emotionally laden processes of post-Yugoslav lesbian activists' (2); in other words, to build an archive of lesbian lives and lesbian activism in the region. Since activists are not (and cannot be) concerned with documenting the things they do, this collection tries to fill the gap, to create a memory that will help fight 'against erasure and disappearance' (10), by combining the historical account of the development of activism with activists' oral histories. Archives, however, do not only offer a glimpse of the past—which is in this collection viewed through nostalgic glasses at times—but are also seen as a way of healing the wounds inflicted by war.

On a meta-level, the mentioned three key notions of 'sisterhood', 'space' and 'knowledge' are to be found in every text of the collection. The 'sisterhood' is visible not only in several co-authored chapters, but in the mutual care and concern evident in the authors' reflections on their (processes of) writing, which they were asked to share with the editors. In addition to documenting how conditions for speaking up have been created, this collection also creates these conditions itself, precisely by offering a space to lesbian voices. And since it forms a part of the archives that document the past, it is in itself a form of (creating) 'knowledge'. The glue tying the meta-world of the volume together with the world 'out there' are the authors' ethnographical ego-statements about their personal involvement in activism.

To conclude, this volume is a valuable and much needed contribution to the re-

cent history (or *herstory*) of (feminist) lesbian organising in the successor states of Yugoslavia, showing the similarities and differences existing in this multinational, multilingual, and multiconfessional region. In addition, it amounts to a call to form ever tighter and firmer ties within the regional, transnational community of women (feminists, lesbians and trans women), a call to collaborate more closely and form networks in order to share knowledge and experiences. This is in line with the intention of the editors to 'align this volume with the tradition of lesbian theoretical and activist interventions' (10), in other words, to make it both scholarly and activist, a task that they have successfully accomplished.

Sandra Antulov (Rijeka)

Adam Fagan/Indraneel Sircar, eds,
Activist Citizenship in Southeast Europe, Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge
2018. 166 pp. ISBN 978-1-138--60489-6,
£ 115.00

The volume *Activist Citizenship in Southeast Europe* gathers seven excellent case studies of practices that expand the notion of political action beyond the institutions of liberal democracy. The introduction, written by the editors Adam Fagan and Indraneel Sircar, discusses three important contributions that the volume makes. First, despite the fact that the countries of Southeastern Europe are commonly characterised as having 'weak' civil societies, various forms of activism do take place there. Second, by delving into the history of some of the case studies, the authors show that the forms of activism they study did not develop within the core and then disseminated to South-

eastern Europe, i.e. the periphery, but that the cases often display innovative and trailblazing characteristics. Finally, some of the contributions point out that small political acts—infra-politics, in James C. Scott's parlance—that often are dismissed as unimportant, indeed, are indispensable for a civil society that goes beyond the form of non-governmental organizations.

Following the introduction, *Chiara Milan's* chapter analyses the differences between two waves of popular mobilisation in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Milan identifies the domination of performative practices of citizenship in the 2013 Baby Revolution (#JMBG) protests, in which participants brought about 'moments of rupture that created possibilities for social change' (11). The 2014 'social uprising', on the other hand, exhibits a prefigurative orientation for Milan, by creating 'alternative social arrangements that prefigured a new model of citizenship' (11).

The second chapter, authored by *Astrid Reinprecht*, investigates how the repertoire that Serbian student protesters relied on changed in relation to the changing circumstances and collective identification of protesters. Appropriation of some innovations from student protests that were taking place in other European countries allowed Serbian students to widen the longstanding framing of student movements in Yugoslavia and other post-Yugoslav countries in order to articulate 'a comprehensive critique of neoliberalism in the public sphere' (42).

In the third chapter, *Alen Toplišek* and *Lasse Thomassen* focus on Slovenian 2012–2013 popular mobilisation that led to the development of new political parties to examine horizontality and verticality, i.e. the two aspects of social movements and political parties that are evident in organizational decision-making structures and

the relationship with the state. Instead of enforcing the binary opposition, the authors claim that 'there is no horizontality without verticality' (49) as the two are intertwined in any organisation and an outcome of negotiation by agents that comprise those organisations.

In the fourth chapter, *Danijela Dolenec*, *Karin Doolan*, and *Tomislav Tomašević* analyze the changes that the Right to the City Movement in Croatia has undergone. Instead of focusing on institutional self-preservation, the authors argue that the movement opted for social impact, which translated into organisational shape-shifting—evident in the five phases that the authors identify in less than a decade of organising—and resulted in 'encouraging citizen engagement and political participation' (87).

The fifth chapter, authored by *Bojan Bača*, discusses a social movement that emerged in the Montenegrin village of Beranselo in opposition to government policy regarding garbage disposal. Bača argues that, as the mobilisation echoed on the national level, it created a political frame for the struggle against injustice and marginalisation that could not be reduced to any existing 'ethnic-cum-political identity' (113), which allowed the political subjectivation of other Montenegrins as unrepresented in the polity.

In the sixth chapter, *Piotr Goldstein* focuses on forms of activism that aim to create counter-spaces that are different from forms of activism and politics embodied in NGOs and social movements. For some of the people that the author studies, such activism is an alternative to more formal activism, while for others, it is complementary, as it creates an infrastructure for other forms of activism or catalyses them.

The final chapter, authored by *Alexandra Ana*, analyses the role of feminists in the

anti-austerity protests that took place in Romania in the winter of 2012. Ana differentiates between redistribution claims made by feminists, some of which were largely accepted by other protesters, and recognition claims, which feminists thought were not so easily accepted. Despite ideological differences among Romanian feminists, which, Ana argues, prevented their acting as a unified bloc, feminists had a significant influence on the course of the 2012 protests.

The unifying theoretical idea behind the collection is the notion of 'activist citizenship', developed by Engin Isin. This seems like a broad enough concept that can contain all of the phenomena on which the authors in this edited volume focus. Isin's interest is not in citizens as a category that precedes political belonging, but rather in practices through which citizenship is claimed. In the aftermath of the French Revolution, actors have constructed themselves as citizens—active citizens of modern states, to be precise—through routinised practices such as voting or paying taxes. In contrast to active citizens, Isin points out how people can enact new political subjectivities in a political community through acts of citizenship that involve the contestation of existing political norms and practices and that bring about a rupture.

Whereas the notion of activist citizenship is a thread that binds all chapters together, the authors do not all approach it in the same way. Isin calls on citizenship scholars to examine what makes a citizen. That requires a grounded examination of a specific historical configuration of 'rights', 'sites', 'scales', and 'actors' alongside 'acts'.¹ Some of the

chapters offer a wider examination of political action in the context that are studied, against the backdrop of which the acts of citizenship they write about take place (most notably, Baća and Reinprecht). However, the majority of chapters remain more narrowly focused on the phenomena they study, which are gathered under the umbrella of 'activist citizenship' even though Isin's approach does not inform them to a great degree (most notably, Toplišek / Thomassen and Ana).

This is a missed opportunity not because Isin's work should necessarily guide analysis, but because it seems like a framework that is flexible enough to allow a grounded theory of citizenship in the region. This point is related to a wider point about knowledge production. All of the authors should be applauded for engaging with works by scholars from the places they study, as well as sources in the local languages. However, the analytical work they engage in critically depends on theory from the core of academic production. Other than Isin, the authors engage with various theorists to analyse their material: Della Porta, Tilly, Tarrow, Snow, Rancière, Sitrin, Mouffe, Lefebvre, Fraser—to name but a few. Some of the chapters cite the work of Štiks and Horvat, who attempted to situate recent examples of contentious politics in the post-Yugoslav space in the specific predicament of postsocialist neoliberalism and the 'desert of transition' that it brought about.² However, their work,

ity 29, no. 1 (2009), 367-388, 372, DOI: 10.1057/sub.2009.25.

² Igor Štiks / Srećko Horvat, Introduction. Radical Politics in the Desert of Transition, in: Srećko Horvat and Igor Štiks, eds, *Welcome to the Desert of Post-Socialism. Radical Politics After Yugoslavia*, New York/NY 2015, 1-17.

¹ Engin F. Isin, *Citizenship in Flux. The Figure of the Activist Citizen*, *Subjectiv-*

which focused on a series of protests that lead them to call the Balkans 'the rebel peninsula', is cited as a bridge to broader interests in a global wave of uprising rather than as an attempt to theorise phenomena in the region themselves. Reading the volume, I was hoping that some of the authors might, in their future work, take up the ambitious question of what a grounded theory of citizenship and contentious politics in Southeastern Europe could be.

Still, the collection is a welcome addition to the interdisciplinary conversation on social movements and citizenship. It challenges us to rethink citizenship claims in Southeastern Europe and to consider what political actions can be when they eschew institutions of liberal democracy, such as political parties or non-governmental organisations. The authors discuss their cases in a subtle manner, which allows them to not predetermine what political success is. Rather, they explore how the understanding of success is tied to broader political contexts in which activist citizens operate and how those contexts could be transformed through various forms of activism.

Ognjen Kojanić (Pittsburgh)

Larisa Jašarević, *Health and Wealth on the Bosnian Market. Intimate Debt*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2017. 282 pp., ISBN 978-0-253-02382-7, \$ 21.16

What are the connections between health and wealth, between medicine and the market? This is just one of the questions that Larisa Jašarević poses in her book *Health and Wealth on the Bosnian Market. Intimate Debt*. Jašarević investigates the entanglements between the

economy, the living body and the notion of the good life in postsocialist and post-conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina. Her ethnography is based on extensive fieldwork in the Bosnian city of Tuzla and is a great contribution to the scholarship on former Yugoslavia as well as to medical anthropology and political economy more broadly.

Jašarević's work fits well with other recent ethnographies of contemporary Bosnia, such as those by Azra Hromadžić, Stef Jansen, Elissa Helms, and Čarna Brković, that move beyond studies of ethnicity, nationalism and politics with a capital P.¹ Jašarević steers away from presenting Bosnia-Herzegovina and the wider region as perpetually trapped in the tropes of balkanisation, backwardness, and transition. The book with its focus on alternative forms of health, spiritual and bodily healing could have easily slipped into orientalising and balkanising tropes. However, Jašarević masterfully evades such tropes by focusing on the embodied and entangled nature of health and wealth, on the body and the economy. Drawing on the work of philosopher Jean Luc Nancy, she is interested in exploring more than just the particularities of the Bosnian context but the human condition overall.

¹ Azra Hromadžić, *Citizens of an Empty Nation. Youth and State-Making in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*, Philadelphia/PA 2015; Stef Jansen, *Yearnings in the Meantime. 'Normal Lives' and the State in a Sarajevo Apartment Complex*, New York/NY, Oxford 2015; Elissa Helms, *Innocence and Victimhood. Gender, Nation, and Women's Activism in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*, Madison/WI, London 2013; Čarna Brković, *Managing Ambiguity. How Clientelism, Citizenship, and Power Shape Personhood in Bosnia and Herzegovina*, New York/NY, Oxford 2017.

which focused on a series of protests that lead them to call the Balkans 'the rebel peninsula', is cited as a bridge to broader interests in a global wave of uprising rather than as an attempt to theorise phenomena in the region themselves. Reading the volume, I was hoping that some of the authors might, in their future work, take up the ambitious question of what a grounded theory of citizenship and contentious politics in Southeastern Europe could be.

Still, the collection is a welcome addition to the interdisciplinary conversation on social movements and citizenship. It challenges us to rethink citizenship claims in Southeastern Europe and to consider what political actions can be when they eschew institutions of liberal democracy, such as political parties or non-governmental organisations. The authors discuss their cases in a subtle manner, which allows them to not predetermine what political success is. Rather, they explore how the understanding of success is tied to broader political contexts in which activist citizens operate and how those contexts could be transformed through various forms of activism.

Ognjen Kojanić (Pittsburgh)

Larisa Jašarević, *Health and Wealth on the Bosnian Market. Intimate Debt*, Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2017. 282 pp., ISBN 978-0-253-02382-7, \$ 21.16

What are the connections between health and wealth, between medicine and the market? This is just one of the questions that Larisa Jašarević poses in her book *Health and Wealth on the Bosnian Market. Intimate Debt*. Jašarević investigates the entanglements between the

economy, the living body and the notion of the good life in postsocialist and post-conflict Bosnia and Herzegovina. Her ethnography is based on extensive fieldwork in the Bosnian city of Tuzla and is a great contribution to the scholarship on former Yugoslavia as well as to medical anthropology and political economy more broadly.

Jašarević's work fits well with other recent ethnographies of contemporary Bosnia, such as those by Azra Hromadžić, Stef Jansen, Elissa Helms, and Čarna Brković, that move beyond studies of ethnicity, nationalism and politics with a capital P.¹ Jašarević steers away from presenting Bosnia-Herzegovina and the wider region as perpetually trapped in the tropes of balkanisation, backwardness, and transition. The book with its focus on alternative forms of health, spiritual and bodily healing could have easily slipped into orientalising and balkanising tropes. However, Jašarević masterfully evades such tropes by focusing on the embodied and entangled nature of health and wealth, on the body and the economy. Drawing on the work of philosopher Jean Luc Nancy, she is interested in exploring more than just the particularities of the Bosnian context but the human condition overall.

¹ Azra Hromadžić, *Citizens of an Empty Nation. Youth and State-Making in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*, Philadelphia/PA 2015; Stef Jansen, *Yearnings in the Meantime. 'Normal Lives' and the State in a Sarajevo Apartment Complex*, New York/NY, Oxford 2015; Elissa Helms, *Innocence and Victimhood. Gender, Nation, and Women's Activism in Postwar Bosnia-Herzegovina*, Madison/WI, London 2013; Čarna Brković, *Managing Ambiguity. How Clientelism, Citizenship, and Power Shape Personhood in Bosnia and Herzegovina*, New York/NY, Oxford 2017.